



City of Perth

**Design Advisory Committee
Minutes**

**14 May 2020
3pm**

Via Videoconference

APPROVED FOR RELEASE

Mr Murray Jorgensen
Chief Executive Officer



City of Perth

**Design Advisory Committee
Minutes**

**14 May 2020
3pm**

Via Videoconference

Minutes to be confirmed at the next Design Advisory Committee meeting.

THESE MINUTES ARE HEREBY CERTIFIED AS CONFIRMED

Presiding Member's Signature

DATE: _____

Order of Business

Item

1. Declaration of opening
2. Apologies and members on leave of absence
3. Confirmation of minutes
4. Correspondence
5. Disclosures of members interest
6. Reports

Item No.	Item Title	Page No.
6.1	240 (Lot 102) Adelaide Terrace, Perth – Proposed Demolition of the Existing Commercial Buildings and the Construction of a 32 Level Mixed Use Development Comprising of 119 Multiple Dwellings, 142 Car Parking Bays and Two Commercial Tenancies – Transfer of Plot Ratio and Bonus Plot Ratio	7

7. Motions of which previous notice has been given
8. General Business
9. Items for consideration at a future meeting
10. Closure

Attendance

Minutes of the Design Advisory Committee meeting of the City of Perth in Committee Room 1, Level 9, Council House, 27 St Georges Terrace, Perth on Thursday, 19 March 2020.

Members in attendance

Mr Hobbs	(Deputy Member)
Mr Howe	
Mr Melsom	
Mr Miragliotta	General Manager Planning and Economic Development

Officers in attendance

Mr Smith	City Architect
Ms Smith	Alliance Manager Development Approvals
Mr Gericke	Principal Statutory Planner
Ms Hancock	Senior Statutory Planner
Mr Fotev	3D Model Coordinator
Ms Phillips	Governance Officer

Guests and deputations

Mr Simpson	PTS Town Planning
Mr Chang	SS Chang Architects
Mr Cameron	Finbar

Observer

Mr De Marchi

1. Declaration of opening

The General Manager Planning and Economic Development, Mr Miragliotta declared the meeting open at 3.03pm

In accordance with Section 5.6 of the *Local Government Act 1995*, the General Manager Planning and Economic Development sought nominations for a member to preside over the meeting.

Mr Howe nominated Mr Hobbs to preside over the meeting.

There being no further nominations, Mr Hobbs accepted the nomination and assumed the Chair.

2. Apologies

Mr Karotkin	Apology
Ms Payne	Apology
Mr Kerr	Apology
Mr Pullybank	Apology

3. Confirmation of minutes

Committee Resolution

Moved: Mr Melsom

Seconded: Mr Miragliotta

That the minutes of the Design Advisory Committee Meeting held on 19 March 2020 be CONFIRMED as a true and correct record.

CARRIED 4 / 0

For:

Mr Hobbs

Mr Howe

Mr Melsom

Mr Miragliotta

Against:

Nil

4. Correspondence

Nil

5. Disclosures of members interest

Nil

Presentation: Agenda Item 6.1 – 240 (Lot 102) Adelaide Terrace, Perth – Proposed Demolition of the Existing Commercial Buildings and the Construction of a 32 Level Mixed Use Development Comprising of 119 Multiple Dwellings, 142 Car Parking Bays and Two Commercial Tenancies – Transfer of Plot Ratio and Bonus Plot Ratio.

3.06pm The Senior Statutory Planner commenced the presentation and provided an overview of the proposed development application. Alliance Manager Development Approvals and Senior Statutory Planner then answered questions from the Design Advisory Committee.

3.19pm The presentation concluded.

Deputation: Agenda Item 6.1 – 240 (Lot 102) Adelaide Terrace, Perth – Proposed Demolition of the Existing Commercial Buildings and the Construction of a 32 Level Mixed Use Development Comprising of 119 Multiple Dwellings, 142 Car Parking Bays and Two Commercial Tenancies – Transfer of Plot Ratio and Bonus Plot Ratio.

3.21pm Mr Hobbs introduced the members of the deputation and the deputies provided a comprehensive overview of the proposed development application. The deputation then answered questions from the Design Advisory Committee.

4.13pm The deputation concluded.

6. Reports

6.1 240 (Lot 102) Adelaide Terrace, Perth – Proposed Demolition of the Existing Commercial Buildings and the Construction of a 32 Level Mixed Use Development Comprising of 119 Multiple Dwellings, 142 Car Parking Bays and Two Commercial Tenancies – Transfer of Plot Ratio and Bonus Plot Ratio

File reference	DA-2020/5078
Report author	Jasmine Hancock, Senior Statutory Planner
Other contributors	Nil
Reporting service unit and alliance	Development Approvals, Planning and Economic Development
Report author disclosure of interest	Nil
Date of report	5 May 2020
Attachment/s	Attachment 6.1A – Location Plan Attachment 6.1B – Perspectives An FTP Link is provided to Committee members with the Development Plans
Landowner	240 Adelaide Terrace Pty Ltd
Applicant	Finbar Group Ltd
Zoning	(MRS Zone) Central City Area (City Planning Scheme Precinct) Adelaide (P13) (City Planning Scheme Use Area) Office/Residential
Approximate cost	\$31 million

Background

The subject site is located on the northern side of Adelaide Terrace with a total site area of 1,697m². Two commercial buildings are located on the site. Vehicular access is provided via an existing right of carriageway located along the eastern boundary of the site, which also service the properties at 234 and 236 Adelaide Terrace and 369 Hay Street, Perth.

Details

The application seeks approval to demolish two existing commercial buildings located on the site and to construct a 32 level mixed-use development comprising of 119 multiple dwellings, 142 car parking bays and two commercial tenancies. In summary the proposed development will comprise of:

- 15 studio apartments, 28 one bedroom apartments, 56 two bedroom apartments and 20 three bedroom apartments;
- two commercial tenancies located on the ground floor level fronting Adelaide Terrace;
- an amenities deck with communal facilities for residents such as a swimming pool, sauna, massage room, theatrette, dining room, cabana and barbeque area, lounge and games room, business centre and gymnasium;
- a roof deck area with a communal lounge and bar for residents; and
- four commercial car parking bays and 138 residential car parking bays with access via an existing right of carriageway.

Ground Floor	This level contains two commercial tenancies fronting onto Adelaide Terrace (77m ² and 131m ²) as well as the main entrance lobby and concierge to the residential apartments. A parcel locker and mail room, residential storerooms and back of house services including the bin storage and compacting rooms. Residential and commercial car parking is also provided at this level with vehicular access via an existing right of carriageway.
Levels 1 to 4	Each level contains three studio apartments fronting onto Adelaide Terrace (37m ²), 26 car parking bays (including 4 tandem bays at each level), 18 residential storerooms and 10 bicycle bays sleeved behind the residential apartments.
Level 5	This level contains three studio apartments fronting onto Adelaide Terrace (37m ²), 24 residential car parking bays and 37 residential storerooms.
Level 6	This level contains the residential amenities deck including a communal swimming pool, cabana and barbeque area, sauna and massage rooms, dining room, theatrette, lounge, bar and games room, business centre and gymnasium.
Levels 7 to 20	Each level contains four 2 bedroom, 2 bathroom apartments (86m ²) and two 1 bedroom, 1 bathroom apartments (51m ²) as well as a common air conditioning services area.
Level 21	This level contains two 3 bedroom, 2 bathroom apartments (130m ²) each with its own outdoor courtyard and artificial lawn and landscaped area.
Levels 22 to 30	Each level contains two 3 bedroom, 2 bathroom apartments (130m ²).
Roof Level	The level contains a communal lounge and bar for residents as well as an open plant deck area.

The applicant advises that the building will be designed to create a prominent high-rise built form with bold and distinctive facades inspired by naturally geometric forms that will enrich the Perth skyline. The building has been designed in a podium and tower form with articulation to create a slender appearance. The podium proposes a canopy awning over the footpath rising to a double volume coupled with perforated bronze coloured pre-fabricated element to enhance the street elevation. With a focus on a cohesive glazed façade the proposal employs the use of partially enclosed and weather protected balconies on the podium and throughout the tower to create high amenity and protected spaces. Landscaping has been designed into the development to enhance the building’s aesthetics and provide a relief to the urban landscape.

Compliance with Planning Scheme

Land use

The subject site is located in the Office/Residential use area of the Adelaide Precinct 13 under CPS2. The Adelaide Precinct will be developed as a residential quarter accommodating a wide range of residential and visitor accommodation and employment opportunities serviced by activities which support these uses. The Precinct will also accommodate offices, functioning as a secondary, less intensive, general office district and contain a mixture of general commercial activities of a kind that will contribute to residential amenity.

The proposed use of the building as multiple dwellings 'Residential' is a preferred 'P' use in the Office/Residential Use Area of the Adelaide Precinct 13 under CPS2. The proposed ground floor commercial tenancies are proposed for either 'Office' and/or 'Dining' uses which are also preferred ('P') uses in this location as well as 'Retail (General)' which is a contemplated 'C' use and therefore can be considered.

Development requirements

Development within the Adelaide Precinct is to be at an intensity markedly lower than the city centre. It will generally be characterised by medium scale development. Buildings will have a nil street setback and be of a low scale along the street frontage to provide a consistent and continuous urban edge. Additional building height will be set back from all lot boundaries. Buildings should be designed to a high standard and evoke a sense of prestige. This will be further enhanced by grand scale boulevard planting along Adelaide Terrace.

The proposal's compliance with the CPS2 development requirements is summarised below:

Development Standard	Proposed	Permitted/Required
Maximum Plot Ratio:	4.62:1 (7,840m²) inclusive of a plot ratio transfer of 10.5% made up of (434m²) from 76 Wittenoom Street, East Perth and (278m²) from 938 Hay Street, Perth; and bonus plot ratio 5% (340m²) for the provision of a specific public facility on private land	Base Plot Ratio 4:1 (6,788m ²) Maximum Bonus Plot Ratio of 50% consisting of a combination of any of the below: Special Residential Development (20% and 40% for high quality hotel maximum) Heritage Conservation/Public Facilities/Transfer Plot Ratio (20% maximum)

Development Standard	Proposed	Permitted/Required
Building height:	21.2 metres street building height followed by a 10 metre setback up to a total height of 101.4 metres	Maximum street building height of 21 metres with a 5 metre setback up to 65 metres and a 10 metre setback above this with no prescribed maximum height limit
Setbacks: Side – West - Lower building level - Upper building level Side – East - Lower building level - Upper building level Rear - Lower building level - Upper building level	 Nil 4 metres 4 metres (up to 66.75 metres) and 8 metres above Nil 2.47 metres 2.47 metres (up to 66.75 metres), 5.9 metres above Nil 12 metres 12 metres	 Nil (no openings/balconies) 4 metres (up to 65 metres) 8 metres (above 65 metres) Nil (no openings/balconies) 4 metres (up to 65 metres) 8 metres (above 65 metres) Nil (no openings/balconies) 4 metres (up to 65 metres) 8 metres (above 65 metres)
Car Parking: Commercial Tenant	3 bays plus one universal access bay	25 bays (maximum)

Development Standard	Proposed	Permitted/Required
Residential	138 bays	119 bays (minimum) 238 bays (maximum)
Bicycle Parking:		
Commercial	2 bays	1 bay
Residential	51 bays	40 bays

Transfer Plot Ratio

The application proposes a transfer of plot ratio of 10.5% or 732m² of plot ratio floor area, with 434m² from 76 (Lot 5) Wittenoom Street, East Perth and 278m² from 938 (Lots 4-10) Hay Street, Perth, which are both listed as donor sites on the City's Register 2 - Transferred Plot Ratio under City Planning Scheme No. 2 (CPS2).

Bonus Plot Ratio

In accordance with the provisions of CPS2, the site is eligible for 50% maximum bonus plot ratio which may be comprised of:

- Public Facilities and Heritage: Maximum 20% bonus (includes public spaces, pedestrian links, provision of specific facilities on private land and conservation of heritage places);
- Residential Use: Maximum 20% bonus; and
- Special Residential Use: Maximum 40% bonus (20% for a special residential use or 40% for high a quality hotel use).

The application is seeking the award of 5% bonus plot ratio or 340m² of plot ratio floor area for the provision of a specific public facility on private land. The bonus is for the widening of the existing right of carriageway to improve the safety and access potential for waste collection and servicing arrangements for this development as well as for use by the adjoining properties. This is based on the application complying with the requirements specified under clause 28 of CPS2 and the City's Bonus Plot Ratio Policy 4.5.1 as outlined by the applicant below:

"The proposed specific facility is the widening of the right of carriageway. The widening ranges from 1.783 metres in width at the Adelaide Terrace crossover to 1.807 metres towards the rear. The area of the widening is approximately 100m². The widening of the right of carriageway will enable the effective servicing and waste collection for the three other properties (234 and 236 Adelaide Terrace and 369 Hay Street) that currently use the right of carriageway plus the proposed development site. The policy provides for facilities such as public loading docks and we consider that the widening of the right of carriageway to service the lots is a similar facility.

The landowner will provide a right of carriageway (limited in height) over the right of carriageway extension to enable the other lots to use the area.

The benefits from the right of way (ROW) widening include:

- Providing a 6 metre wide access (used by four different lots) will allow for safe two way access along almost the entire 56 metre length as well as allowing the City's preferred waste truck to collect from 240 Adelaide Terrace;*
- The widened access will provide for the City's preferred waste truck to collect waste from 236 Adelaide Terrace. The lot is only 12 metres wide and has a right to use the private ROW. The ability to access the lot from the ROW for waste collection has the potential to allow current waste collection to occur at the rear of the site with minor modifications and equally allow any future re-development of the site the potential to retain a fully activated frontage to Adelaide Terrace. Current arrangements require internal management of vehicles that prohibits their exit from 6.30am to 6pm.*
- The widened access would allow for safer vehicle access to and from the rear of 228 Adelaide Terrace. This lot has a right to use the private ROW. The City's waste trucks would potentially be able to drive into the rear of 228 Adelaide Terrace from Adelaide Terrace, collect waste then exit onto Hill Street, all in a forward gear.*
- The widened ROW would allow for safer vehicle access to and from the rear of 369 Hay Street (Royale Apartments, Lot 889 369 Hay Street). There is also the potential for the strata company and the City to explore potential alternative waste collection opportunities.*
- The access and the potential link through to Hill Street is an opportunity that the City can explore upon redevelopment of 228 Adelaide Terrace, which could have potential benefits to properties along Hay Street.*

Essential Criteria

The facility meets a public need that is appropriate and desirable for the immediate locality as it will resolve safety issues currently experienced within the right of carriageway for the benefit of the other three landowners and service providers.

The extension of the right of carriageway is appropriately located within the development and meets the identified public need for servicing of the adjoining three properties.

Performance Requirements

There is a public need for the widening of the right of carriageway in the location proposed as advised by the service providers.

The width of the extension to the right of carriageway is appropriate to its function and surrounding land uses, providing a safe means of servicing the other three properties.

As identified above, a right of carriageway (limited in height) over the right of carriageway extension will be provided to enable the other lots to use the area.

The right of carriageway can be used at all times.”

State Planning Policy 7.0 - Design of the Built Environment

State Planning Policy 7.0 - Design of the Built Environment addresses design quality and built form outcomes seeking to deliver the broad economic, environmental, social and cultural benefits that derive from good design outcomes. It sets out the objectives, measures, principles and processes which apply to the design and assessment of built environment proposals through the planning system.

The applicant has provided their response to the design principles of the Policy, which is summarised below:

Design Principle	Comments
<p>1. Context and character</p> <p>Good design responds to and enhances the distinctive characteristics of a local area, contributing to a sense of place.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The built form positively responds to the podium and tower approach contained in the planning framework. • The podium responds to the lower height commercial buildings along Adelaide Terrace adjoining the site with the tower setback from boundaries to minimise any impact from building bulk while also providing natural light and ventilation to the proposed dwellings. • The proposed development meets the Statement of Intent for the Precinct by providing a residential development with commercial ground level uses. • The vehicle access is shared through the common right of carriageway minimising any impact to the Adelaide Terrace pedestrian environment. • The dwellings are setback from the rear boundary providing a high level of separation to the dwellings on the property fronting Hay Street. • The density of the development provided is entirely appropriate for the site and seeks to maximise the number of inner-city residents.
<p>2. Landscape quality</p> <p>Good design recognises that together landscape and buildings operate as an integrated and sustainable system, within a broader ecological context.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The built form occupies the majority of the site and therefore landscaping is largely limited to the podium residential amenities. • The development includes landscaping adjacent to the right of carriageway at ground level that softens the elevation and which extends into the lobby area. • The lobby includes green walls to improve the amenity of the ground floor Adelaide Terrace building entrance and residential lobby.

Design Principle	Comments
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The landscape intent is to provide planting on structure on the podium to provide an amenity for the residents. • The landscaping includes planters to the edge of the podium to soften the built form. • The entire podium is allocated to residential amenities which provides areas to the north and south of the tower above. This provides flexibility to use the space depending on sunlight and wind conditions.
<p>3. Built form and scale</p> <p>Good design ensures that the massing and height of development is appropriate to its setting and successfully negotiates between existing built form and the intended future character of the local area.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The development responds to the Adelaide Terrace street frontage through commercial tenancies and a generous residential lobby. • The development is of a scale that is consistent with the built form established for the Precinct. • The provision of services and plant has been located behind the Adelaide Terrace frontage maximising the pedestrian experience. • The generous side and rear setbacks above podium will ensure views through the site and along Adelaide Terrace. • The podium height responds to the planning framework and the adjoining commercial buildings. • The sleeving of the residential dwellings in the podium to the Adelaide Terrace frontage will ensure activity and passive surveillance.
<p>4. Functionality and build quality</p> <p>Good design meets the needs of users efficiently and effectively, balancing functional requirements to perform well and deliver optimum benefit over the full life-cycle.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The design is functional to both the intent of the Precinct and the design of the dwellings. • The dwellings are provided with a high level of amenity through the design, orientation and access to amenities. • The dwellings, where possible, are orientated to maximise views and daylight. • Efficient and functional tower floorplate. • Services have been appropriately considered through plant location and a common AC Services Area reducing any impact to the dwellings.
<p>5. Sustainability</p> <p>Good design optimises the sustainability of the built environment, delivering positive environmental, social and economic outcomes</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The site is located on Adelaide Terrace which is a major public transport route. • The site has good access to public open space along the foreshore. • The site has good access to services and amenities. • The dwellings have been designed with good solar access and natural ventilation reducing reliance on technology. With the exception of the street front podium studios and the middle units in the tower, all other dwellings are located on a corner with cross ventilation and access to natural light. • The tower facade responds to orientation and views.

Design Principle	Comments
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A podium roof terrace is provided that enables year round use by having both a north and south facing amenity area. • Naturally ventilated corridors for the Tower. • Access to natural light for the lift lobby. • Careful consideration of location of services.
<p>6. Amenity</p> <p>Good design provides successful places that offer a variety of uses and activities while optimising internal and external amenity for occupants, visitors and neighbours, providing environments that are comfortable, productive and healthy</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The dwellings are provided with a high level of amenity through their size, access to light and good levels of cross ventilation. • The dwellings are provided with balconies that have access to light and ventilation. • The communal areas include solar access and are of sufficient size to cater for the needs of the residents. • Located to take into account access to daylight, mitigated against wind and weather. • Range of podium garden terraces and amenities.
<p>7. Legibility</p> <p>Good design results in buildings and places that are legible, with clear connections and easily identifiable elements to help people find their way around</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The development provides a clear understanding of the various land uses. • The scale of the built form is consistent with the vision for the area. • The entrances to the various land uses are clearly defined. • The development provides an improved pedestrian amenity to Adelaide Terrace.
<p>8. Safety</p> <p>Good design optimises safety and security, minimising the risk of personal harm and supporting safe behaviour and use.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The development provides a mix of uses providing activity and passive surveillance 24 hours a day. • The development separates the public pedestrian domain from cars and deliveries through the use of the existing right of carriageway. • The ground and podium levels are sleeved with uses that will provide passive surveillance to Adelaide Terrace.
<p>9. Community</p> <p>Good design responds to local community needs as well as the wider social context, providing environments that support a diverse range of people and facilitate social interaction.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The development provides additional residents within Perth. • The additional residents will support the local services while also providing activity after normal business hours. • The development includes a range of dwellings types from studio apartments to 3-bedroom apartments. This provides for a range of household sizes and also price point.

<p>10. Aesthetics</p> <p>Good design is the product of a skilled, judicious design process that results in attractive and inviting buildings and places that engage the senses.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The built form positively responds to the podium and tower approach contained in the planning framework. • The podium provides an articulated design that appropriately balances variety and consistency and breaks down the building bulk. • High standard of materials and an appropriate level of consistency and variety in the podium. • Prefabricated feature honeycomb element complimented with precast bas relief on podium wall delivers a striking elevation. • The articulated building façade and tower breakups create an interesting response for the development when viewed from the street, R.O.C. and surrounding properties.
---	--

Comments

The City raised two design issues with the applicant which was identified as areas of some concern and the applicant indicated that these will be further considered and options to address the concerns prepared for consideration by the DAC. The two concerns raised were:

1. that more than a third of the mature street tree adjacent to the site overhangs the property boundary on Adelaide Terrace, which will have to be pruned/removed to accommodate the nil setback to the podium and that this would not be supported; and
2. the design of some partially enclosed balconies to the studio units in the podium are deeper than wide and have only a small portion of glazing. They are likely to be used as a room rather than as a balcony and would therefore, not be considered to be excluded from plot ratio as they do not meet the definition or intent of a balcony under the City Planning Scheme.

Conclusion

The Design Advisory Committee is requested to comment on the design and bonus plot ratio aspects of the development detailed in the following recommendation section of this report.

A verbal presentation will be given to the Committee in regard to this application.

Committee Recommendation

Moved: Mr Melsom

Seconded: Mr Howe

That the Design Advisory Committee, having considered the revised design and the awarding of bonus plot ratio for the proposed construction of a 32-level mixed-use development comprising of 119 multiple dwellings, with two commercial tenancies on the ground floor and 142 car parking bays at 240 (Lot 101) Adelaide Terrace, Perth:

1. supports the awarding of 6.3% bonus plot ratio for widening the existing right of carriageway (the provision of a specific public facility provided on private land) in compliance with the City's Bonus Plot Ratio Policy 4.5.1, noting that this will be enabling infrastructure for the redevelopment of the adjacent sites in addition to improving access and servicing for the existing development that will have rights of access over the designated portion of the site;
2. supports the general design of the development, including the residential apartment layouts, but considers further design improvements could be achieved by:
 - 2.1 improving the presentation of the podium levels to the street, particularly the ground level interface with the street, through the use of high quality and durable materials; providing canopies for pedestrian shelter and the incorporation of lighting elements and further articulation of the front facade;
 - 2.2 increasing the ground level floor-to-floor height to provide more generous and welcoming commercial spaces and residential lobby;
 - 2.3 providing additional detail, including sections, to ensure that the 'honeycomb' façade elements are appropriately articulated;
 - 2.4 investigating the possibility of incorporating lighting into the 'honeycomb' feature on the tower facades to highlight this design element at night as well as during the day;
 - 2.5 reducing the width of the upper-most 'eyebrow' element so that it is harmonious with the other facade features;
 - 2.6 enhancing the quality of the right of carriageway by improving the building interface with the laneway, including a more meaningful link from the ground floor landscape space into the lane way; through material change to create a pedestrian corridor beneath the awning; and ensuring the awning height is sufficient to provide clearance for commercial/service vehicles using the right of carriageway; and
 - 2.7 incorporating artistic elements into the screening to the car park to enhance the amenity of the right of carriageway and to prevent parked cars from being viewed from the street and adjoining properties.
3. accepts the variations to the maximum street building height and side setback requirements of the City Planning Scheme No. 2 and Building Heights and Setbacks Policy (4.4) noting that the design satisfies the principles of the current Policy; and

4. acknowledges that the revised design will have a lesser impact on the canopy of the adjacent street tree but suggests that the applicant engage an arborculturist to confirm the viability of the tree following the extent of pruning that will be required to construct the proposed development.

CARRIED 4 / 0

For:

Mr Hobbs
Mr Howe
Mr Melsom
Mr Miragliotta

Against:

Nil

7. Motions of which previous notice has been given

Nil

8. General business

Nil

9. Items for consideration at a future meeting

Nil

10. Closure

The Acting Presiding Member declared the meeting closed at 4.42pm.